

Name of Applicant	Proposal	Expiry Date	Plan Ref.
Rebekka Fiorani	<p>Single storey extension to form new entrance and waiting area to the front, single storey extension to the side, first floor extension incorporating attic space of new extension to provide additional offices</p> <p>Clent Vets, 5 Kidderminster Road, Bromsgrove, Worcestershire, B61 7JJ</p>	05.12.2017	17/01153/FUL

Councillor Buxton has requested that the application is considered by the Members of Planning Committee rather than being under Delegated Powers.

RECOMMENDATION: That planning permission be Refused.

Consultations

Mary Worsfold Consulted 31.10.2017

5 Kidderminster Road comprises a large two storey 1980s building with extensions to the rear, fronting the roundabout at the bottom of Kidderminster Road, where it intersects with St Johns Street and Hanover Street. The front section is rendered, while the rear section is red brick, beneath a pitched clay tile roof. There are views of the building as one approaches along St John's Street from the northeast, Kidderminster Road from the north west and Hanover Street from the south, as well as views of the rear across the carpark in Perry lane.

The proposal is to remove the existing porch and replace it with a flat roofed extension along the front of the rendered part of the building; construct a small single storey extension to the south of the rendered section in front of the brick set back section; and a large extension to the side or north west of the building to the rear of 7 & 9 Kidderminster Road.

Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, requires local planning authorities when considering applications in conservation areas to pay attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area. BDP 20.2 of the Bromsgrove Local Plan states that the Local Authority will 'support development proposals which sustain and enhance the significance of Heritage Assets including their setting.' Similarly BDP20.3 states 'Development affecting Heritage Assets, including alterations or additions as well as development within the setting of Heritage Assets, should not have a detrimental impact on the character, appearance or significance of the Heritage Asset or Heritage Assets.' BDP 20.9 requires that 'Development within or adjacent to a Conservation Area should preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the area.'

These clauses are supported by the NPPF, notably Paragraph 137 which states, 'Local planning authorities should look for opportunities for new development within Conservation Areas and World Heritage Sites and within the setting of heritage assets to

enhance or better reveal their significance.' Paragraph 132 requires 'When considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation. The more important the asset, the greater the weight should be. Significance can be harmed or lost through alteration or destruction of the heritage asset or development within its setting. As heritage assets are irreplaceable, any harm or loss should require clear and convincing justification.'

5 Kidderminster Road is located just within the south east boundary of the St Johns Conservation Area. The Conservation Area has substantial historic and architectural interest, with some of the oldest surviving buildings in the town within the Conservation Area. The Church is a strong landmark feature for the town, and is supported by a collection of surrounding listed and unlisted historic buildings dating from the 17th to 19th centuries. The area as a whole has a leafy green setting which contributes to the local sense of place and establishes a positive relationship between the built and the natural environment. The applicant has questioned why this unremarkable building, in fact it is identified in the 2011 Conservation Area Appraisal and Management plan (CAAMP) as a negative building, was included in the conservation area. It has been included because it forms part of a definable block of buildings to the south east of Perry Lane. Conservation areas will include buildings which are negative, but it is poor practice to draw the boundary in such a way as to exclude the negative building where they clearly form part of a group. It is always possible that such sites may come forward for redevelopment in the future. Even if the building fell outside the boundary it would still be within the setting of a designated heritage asset in, in this case the Conservation Area, in addition to several listed buildings, and as can be seen from the Local Plan policies quoted above, any application would be assessed in terms of its impact on these assets.

5 Kidderminster Road is situated to the south east of Perry Lane on the corner of Kidderminster Road, adjacent to a group of small 19th century buildings, on both roads. Despite having been subject to 20th century alterations and extensions they have still retained their historic appearance, and the tight grain that existed in this area historically, illustrated by the 1884 Ordnance Survey Map in the Heritage Statement, is still apparent. The property on the corner of Kidderminster Road and Perry Lane has been extended along Perry Lane, and is described in the Heritage Statement as a poor modern extension, however it has followed the linear form of the original Victorian buildings, with simple detailing including historically correct window openings albeit in upvc, and so complements the Perry Lane and 7-11 Kidderminster Road properties.

5 Kidderminster Road as noted above is a large detached property, at odds with the immediately neighbouring properties in the Conservation Area. The white rendered section to the front of the building reduces the bulk of the building as a whole, as the brick section, although wider is set back. This reduces the bulk of the building in views as one approaches from St Johns Street, and also from Hanover Street. I would have no objection to the removal of the existing porch and the construction of a flat roofed extension to the front of the rendered section, which I do not think will drastically alter the appearance of the building in views from St Johns Street. I do have concerns in respect of the small extension to the front south east corner, which will bring the building forward and will increase the bulky appearance of the building. It will leave it further at odds with its immediate neighbours in the Conservation Area, and will increase its negative impact on the Area. The rear extension will be highly visible in views across the carpark in Perry Lane. It will again increase the bulkiness of the building in views from the north west

which is as noted above out of character with the surrounding buildings, and particularly out of scale with the 19th century Perry Lane properties. The mansard roof detail further detracts as it is not only contrasts with the Victorian buildings, but it is not a typical detail found in this part of Worcestershire. In addition it also jars with the original building.

I would agree with the applicant that the 5 Kidderminster Road is sufficiently far away from any of the listed buildings in the vicinity that the proposed extensions are not likely to impact on their settings and therefore their significance.

The proposal in my opinion would not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the St John's Conservation Area as required by legislation and supported by policies in BDP 20, as well as clauses in the NPPF. The harm to the designated heritage asset, the Conservation Area, has not been justified as required by the NPPF. As the harm is likely to be less than substantial in terms of the NPPF, Paragraph 134 requires that the harm should be weighed against the public benefits. I am of the view that the addition of the proposed extensions to the north west and south east will not outweigh the harm to the designated heritage asset, the conservation of which carries great weight. I would therefore recommend that this application is refused.

Highways - Bromsgrove Consulted 31.10.2017

Has No Objection to the grant of permission.

I have no highway objections to the proposed single storey extension to form new entrance and waiting area to the front, a single storey extension to the side to provide 2 No. additional consulting rooms and internal alterations. Proposed first floor extension incorporating attic space of new extension to provide additional offices.

The site has existing on-site car parking; double yellow parking restrictions exist on one side of Perry Lane which is a dead end road with parking bays on the opposite side. Parking restrictions also exist on the surrounding roads in the vicinity of the site.

WRS - Noise Consulted 31.10.2017

No Comments Received To Date.

Arboricultural Officer Consulted 31.10.2017

I would have no objection to the proposed development in view of any tree related issues.

Drainage Engineers Internal Planning Consultation Consulted 31.10.2017

I therefore have no adverse comments and do not recommend that any conditions are attached to your decision notice.

Relevant Policies

Bromsgrove District Plan

BDP1 Sustainable Development Principles
BDP19 High Quality Design
BDP20 Managing the Historic Environment
NPPF National Planning Policy Framework

Relevant Planning History

B/18679/1989	Single Storey extension to surgery.	Approved	11.12.1989
B/11965/1984	Doctors surgery and flat (As amended by plans received 14.5.84)	Approved	21.05.1984
B/10787/1983	Change of use to veterinary surgery	Approved	23.05.1983
B/10893/1983	Change of use to Museum Antique and Craft Centre	Approved	20.06.1983
B/1992/0451	Extension to provide 2 consulting rooms (as amended by letter dated 28.09.92).	Approved	12.10.1992

Assessment of Proposal

The proposal consists of three elements; the construction of a new entrance to the front of the building, a small lean to the south side of the front elevation and a first floor side extension on the northern side of the building. The existing building was constructed as a doctors surgery in the 1980's and a single storey flat roof extension was constructed on the north side of the building in the early 1990's(Ref: B/18679/1989). The proposal is seeking to facilitate two additional consulting rooms on the ground floor (total of 7), an enlarged entrance/reception area and four offices within the first floor extension.

Impact on Conservation Area

Members should note that the site falls within St John's Conservation Area and of the requirement to preserve or enhance the character of the conservation area as a designated heritage asset as required by policy BDP20 of the Bromsgrove District Plan and paragraphs 134 - 139 of the Framework. Your Officers, in assessing the plans in consultation with the Conservation Officer consider that whilst the front extension to create a larger reception would have a neutral impact on the character of the conservation area, the ground floor single storey side extension and first floor side extension would detract from the building and would be visible from the streetscene (either St John's St or Perry Lane. The single storey ground floor side extension effectively breaks the existing set back of the bulk of the building from the street and the first floor extension would amount to a bulky addition with the amended design proposed amounting to a 'mansard' style roof uncharacteristic of the conservation area. The

applicant's amended Statement of Significance is noted. Whilst the document assesses the impact on listed building settings in the vicinity, it fails to recognize the conservation area as a heritage asset or explain how the proposal would enhance or preserve it. The views of the Conservation Officer should be noted. In summary, the proposed extensions detract from the character building and conservation area contrary to policy BDP20, the NPPF and Section 72 of the Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act 1990.

Impact on Amenity

Members will note from the plans and on the site visit the proximity of the proposal from the rear first floor elevations of the properties 7 - 9 Kidderminster Road and 1, 1a and 3 Perry Lane. The proposed first floor side extension would be located 4.2m from the rear first floor elevation of 7 Kidderminster Road (currently being refurbished for office use) and approximately 5.6m from the rear elevations of the properties on Perry Lane. In the latter case, the first floor has residential occupancy (permitted under application 12/1073) and the amenity of this property would be significantly harmed by the proposal located on it's southern aspect. There is at least one bedroom window facing to the SE elevation of this property. Members should note the Third Party Representations received from the owners of No. 7 Kidderminster Road and your Officer would share the concerns raised in respect of the loss of privacy and amenity to this premises by virtue of the unduly close proximity (4m) of the proposed extension. The proposal conflicts with policy BDP19 and the NPPF.

There are no objections noted from other consultees.

RECOMMENDATION: That planning permission be Refused for the following reasons:

- 1) The proposed extensions would result in significant harm to the character of the conservation area by virtue of the scale, design and position of the extensions. The first floor extension in particular and ground floor side extension would not respect the character of the existing building and would be visible from the streetscene. The proposal would fail to preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area contrary to policy BDP20 of the Bromsgrove District Plan 2017, the National Planning Policy Framework and the requirements of Section 72 of the Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act 2017.
- 2) The first floor side extension element would have a detrimental impact on the amenity of the properties to the east (especially the rear first floors of 7 - 9 Kidderminster Road) and the residential amenity of the properties to the north (Nos. 1, 1A and 3 Perry Lane) through the loss of light and privacy. Thereby, the proposal would be contrary to policies BDP1 and BDP19 of the Bromsgrove District Plan 2017 and the NPPF.

Case Officer: David Kelly Tel: 01527 881345
Email: D.kelly@bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk